Ploydanai, Kunalai

kunalai.ploydanai@wur.nl

January 31, 2017

Dear Dr. Dsouza,

Thank you for the opportunity to revise our manuscript, entitled “Using a virtual supermarket as a research tool to investigate consumer in-store behavior”, JoVE55719.

We appreciate the careful review and insightful suggestions from you and reviewer team. We carefully considered your comments as well as those offered by the four reviewers.

Herein, we summarize how we revised the paper based on the review team’s collective input. The following revision has been made:

1. The paper has been proofread to minimize spelling and grammatical errors, to minimize the use of the pronoun “we” and the use of commercial language.
2. The objective of the paper in a short abstract, an extended abstract and the introduction are improved. The objective is now clearer and more specific to the virtual supermarket that we present.
3. The introduction has been strengthened by including other theories on presence and immersion and by moving information about the advantages of using a virtual store to the discussion section.
4. The protocol has been improved by providing detailed steps of protocol in imperative tense. The numbering and format of our revised protocol have also been adjusted to match JoVE’s instructions for authors.
5. The experimental conditions are explained in detail and depicted to improve the representative results. Additionally, the effect of shopping motivation is clearly stated.
6. Information about other virtual store systems as well as their limitations is provided in a discussion. In addition, practical information is briefly discussed.
7. The protocol and representative results that should be included in the video have been highlighted based on JoVE’s instructions for authors.
8. The quality of the figures has been improved.
9. Separate tables are provided in excel files.
10. References have been revised to match the JoVE format for reference.

It is our belief that the manuscript is substantially improved after making the suggested revisions. Following this letter are the reviewer comments with our responses, including how and where the text was modified. The revision has been developed in consultation with all co-authors, and each author has given approval to the final form of this revision.

Sincerely,

Kunalai Ploydanai, MSc

**Response to the editor.**

Following the editor’s comments (shown in italic), the manuscript has been revised as follows:

***Comment1:*** *Please take this opportunity to thoroughly proofread the manuscript to ensure that there are no spelling or grammatical errors.*

**Authors’ response:** The manuscript has been carefully checked to avoid spelling and grammatical errors.

***Comment2:*** *Please minimize use of the pronoun “we” throughout the manuscript.*

**Authors’ response:** The use of “we” has been reduced in the revised version.  
  
***Comment3:*** *Please include an ethics statement before your numbered protocol steps indicating that the protocol follows the guidelines of your institutions human research ethics committee.*

**Authors’ response:** We have accordingly included the ethics statement in the beginning of the protocol steps (line 151 - 153).

***Comment4: Abstracts:*** *Please re-word the Short Abstract to more clearly state the goal of the protocol. For example, “This protocol/manuscript describes…”*

**Authors’ response:** The short abstract has been improved in a clearer way as shown below:

This paper describes the use of a desktop virtual store to create virtual shopping environments and investigate in-store consumer behavior. A description of the protocol to build and run experiments, example results from an experiment concerning store layout and important considerations when conducting virtual store experiments are presented.

***Comment5:******Protocol Language:*** *Please ensure that all text in the protocol section is written in the imperative tense as if you are telling someone how to do the technique (i.e. “Do this”, “Measure that” etc.) Any text that cannot be written in the imperative tense may be added as a “Note”, however, notes should be used sparingly and actions should be described in the imperative tense wherever possible.*

*1) The protocol section should be made up almost entirely of discrete steps, without large paragraphs of text between sections. Please break up the paragraphs into simple steps (with 2-3 actions per step) as much as possible throughout the protocol. Alternatively, please consider moving long paragraph style text (Lines 115 to 178 and 313 to 332) to the introduction or Discussion.*

**Authors’ response:** The revised protocol is written in discrete and simple steps and written in the imperative tense. Following changes are made:

* Lines 115 to 134 have been rewritten and moved to the introduction (line 133 - 145)
* Lines 135 – 178 have been shortened and moved to discussion (line 608 - 623)
* Other parts of the protocol have been removed or rewritten, such as lines 313 to 332 have been removed.

***Comment6:*** *2) Lines 183-184, 223-227: These should be “notes”*

**Authors’ response:** To improve the revised protocol, we have changed the text in these lines as follows:

* Lines 183 – 184 have been removed.
* Lines 223 – 227 have been rewritten and included in the protocol (line 158 - 161).

***Comment8: Protocol Detail:*** *Please add more details to the ALL protocol steps. There should be enough detail in each step to supplement the actions seen in the video so that viewers can easily replicate the protocol. Please ensure that all additional details in the protocol section are written in the imperative tense, as if you are telling someone how to do the technique (i.e. “Do this”, “Measure that” etc.).*

*1) ALL steps: What would you show each step was filmed? Please provide details of menu selections and button clicks to perform each software action. These pieces of information are necessary for proper scripting and filming for a successfully reproducible protocol. Think about a possible demo example and use that to rewrite ALL your protocol steps.*

**Authors’ response:** The comprehensivedetails of menu selection and button clicks are provided in the revised protocol in imperative tense. These details should enable readers to replicate the protocol and facilitate film makers to make a script.  
  
***Comment7:******Protocol Numbering:*** *Please adjust the numbering of your protocol section to follow JoVE’s instructions for authors, 1. should be followed by 1.1. and then 1.1.1. if necessary and all steps should be lined up at the left margin with no indentations. There must also be a one-line space between each protocol step.*

**Authors’ response:** The numbering and format of our revised protocol have been adjusted to match JoVE’s instructions for authors.  
  
***Comment8:******Protocol Highlight:*** *After you have made all of the recommended changes to your protocol (listed above), please re-evaluate the length of your protocol section. There is a 10-page limit for the protocol text, and a 3- page limit for filmable content. If your protocol is longer than 3 pages, please highlight 2.75 pages or less of text (which includes headings and spaces) in yellow, to identify which steps should be visualized to tell the most cohesive story of your protocol steps. Please see JoVE’s instructions for authors for more clarification. Remember that the non-highlighted protocol steps will remain in the manuscript and therefore will still be available to the reader.*

*1) The highlighting must include all relevant details that are required to perform the step. For example, if step 2.5 is highlighted for filming and the details of how to perform the step are given in steps 2.5.1 and 2.5.2, then the sub-steps where the details are provided must be included in the highlighting.  
2) Please ensure that the highlighted part of the step includes at least one action that is written in imperative tense.  
3) The highlighted steps should form a cohesive narrative, that is, there must be a logical flow from one highlighted step to the next.  
4) Please highlight complete sentences (not parts of sentences). Include sub-headings and spaces when calculating the final highlighted length (2.75 pages or less). Please see JoVE’s instructions for authors for more information.  
5) Notes cannot be filmed and should be excluded from highlighting.  
6) Please remember that software steps without a graphical user interface cannot be filmed.*

**Authors’ response:** We have reconsidered the protocol steps to be included in the video and highlight them according to the requirements of JoVE (see page 4 - 11). The highlighted steps are 2.75 pages long and filmable.

***Comment9:******Discussion:*** *JoVE articles are focused on the methods and the protocol, thus the discussion should be similarly focused. Please ensure that the discussion covers the following in detail and in paragraph form: 1) modifications and troubleshooting, 2) limitations of the technique, 3) significance with respect to existing methods, 4) future applications and 5) critical steps within the protocol.*

**Authors’ response:** The revised discussion now covers all requirements. The first paragraph (line 606 - 630) indicates the critical steps within the protocol. The second paragraph presents significance with respect to existing methods (line 631 - 647). The third paragraph (line 648 - 667) and fourth paragraph (line 669 - 700) discusses the limitations of the technique, and modifications and troubleshooting, respectively. The fifth paragraph (line 702 - 721) presents future applications of the virtual store.

***Comment10:*** *editor’s comments about format of the table, the reference, the Commercial Languages and the abbreviation used in the paper.*

**Authors’ response:** We would like to apologize for using the wrong formats for those parts. The following changes have been made:

1. Individual excel files of each table have been uploaded.

2. The reference format has now been corrected by using the JoVE EndNote style file.

3.All the commercial language has been replaced by the generic term.

4. We have ensured that all abbreviations and symbols are defined at the first use. They are written in the standard format. Single space is used between the numerical value and the unit.

***Comment11:*** *If your figures and tables are original and not published previously or you have already obtained figure permissions, please ignore this comment. If you are re-using figures from a previous publication, you must obtain explicit permission to re-use the figure from the previous publisher (this can be in the form of a letter from an editor or a link to the editorial policies that allows you to re-publish the figure). Please upload the text of the re-print permission (may be copied and pasted from an email/website) as a Word document to the Editorial Manager site in the "Supplemental files (as requested by JoVE)" section. Please also cite the figure appropriately in the figure legend, i.e. "This figure has been modified from [citation]."*

**Authors’ response:** The figures used in this manuscript are original, therefore permission is not needed.